

INSTAGRAM AND AN INDONESIAN IDEAL LEADER

Wahyu Eka Putri¹, Eriyanto^{2*}

¹S.KPm., Department of Communication Science, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences,
University of Indonesia, Indonesia, wahyuekakpm49@gmail.com

²Dr.,M.Si, Department of Communication Science, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences,
University of Indonesia, Indonesia, eriyanto2001@gmail.com

*Corresponding author

Abstract

This article explores Indonesian elected president activities on Instagram during the 2019 election. Instagram create new ways to market political campaigns through the displayed images and new channels for candidates and voters to interact. Self-framing displayed enable to present identifiable image for candidates. To explore the role that images play in framing political character and to identify which images received higher levels of engagement, content analyses were performed on candidates' Instagram account. Political framing identification uses the potential frames character that had previously been carried by Grabe dan Bucy. Grab and Bucy identify images used in the campaign to create a particular political character. The purpose of this study is to describe the representation of Indonesian ideal leader on instagram by using multimodal analysis to understand how Instagram images convey meaning that helps to create those frames. This research concludes with a discussion of the utility of multimodal analysis in understanding campaign images that support the created framing characters. As a candidate, Joko Widodo most frequently employes the ideal candidate frame with subdimensions of statesmanship and compassion. Joko Widodo, as an incumbent candidate, does not show his achievements or symbol of progress as a campaign tool in his image. He uses many family themes and bapakism symbols in Instagram posts. This is in accordance with the cultural values of the Indonesian people, especially Java that a leader must be modest, and uphold the family because he is part of the family. This shows that Javanese cultural values which are one of the cultural values in Indonesian society are in control to influence Joko Widodo to represent himself. Joko Widodo considers the values in each of his Instagram posts, because Javanese culture is a value he embraces (Joko Widodo is of Javanese descent) and sees the condition of the Indonesian people, the majority of which are Javanese.

Keywords: Framing, Instagram, Multimodal Analysis, Javanese Culture

1. INTRODUCTION

The internet, especially social media, has offered new ways of communicating. In politics, the use of social media utilized by politicians to display their self-framing to the public. Facebook, Twitter and Instagram create new ways to market political campaigns and new channels for candidates and voters to interact. Williams (2017) states that through social media, candidates can communicate with voters by utilizing existing features on social media such as sharing text, photos and videos. Images, videos or text published through social media are ways for candidates to framing their self representations to the public.

In 2008, when running for president candidate of the United States, Obama used social media as a political

campaign tool. The use of social media as a new media in political campaigns has changed the way politics is (New York Times (2008)). According to a survey conducted by the Pew Research Center (2012), Barack Obama holds a big advantage over his competitor, Mitt Romney, in mastering and controlling the changes in communication technology. The media (as communication technology) used by Obama to get his victory are facebook, youtube, myspace, twitter, flickr, digg, blackplanet, linkedin, asianave, migente, glee and others (Dutta & Fraser, 2008)

Obama's advantage is not only because of his power in utilizing social media, but it is supported by American people who are well-informed about technology and have high internet consumption. Based on this explanation, it can be seen that the role of social media is important in providing information about presidential elections to its users. This was confirmed by a survey conducted by Pew Research Center (2016) that social media plays an important role in the 2016 presidential election. Based on the survey, 44% of US adults get information about the 2016 presidential election from social media.

One of the social media that is currently experiencing a trend of increasing use in political campaign is Instagram. According to Towner and Munoz (2017), the trend of social media use as a political campaign tool is not only limited to Facebook but also other social media such as SnapChat, Instagram, Tumblr, and Pinterest and this trend has started since the 2012 presidential election. This happens because social media platforms centered on images and videos have had a rapid rate of consumer adoption. This visual-centric social media platform provides a new way of self presentation and image management. This shift to a more visual social media platform is well-known and signifies the potential for increasingly persuasive political social media messages (Muñoz & Towner, 2017).

The result of Twiplomacy (2018) research is that Instagram has become the fastest growing social media network among world leaders, governments and foreign ministers and is the third most used social media platform after Twitter and Facebook, with 81 percent of the 193 UN member countries active on the platform. The three world leaders included in the World Leaders In Instagram 2018 category are Indian Prime Minister Narendra Modi who has the most followers of 14.8 million followers. The second is Indonesian President Joko Widodo @Jokowi with 12.2 million followers who have more than doubled their followers over the past 12 months. The third position is US President Donald Trump with 10 million followers

As one of the three leaders included in the 2018 World Leaders In Instagram, Joko Widodo uses Instagram as a campaign tool to display self-framing as the ideal leader in front of voters. Fenno (1978) found that the use of Instagram is part of the way the candidates present themselves in front of voters in accordance with what they want to expect. Images that they have posted on Instagram are a means for voters to identify candidates personality (O'Connell, 2018)

The power of framing offered by Instagram is what leaders or candidates use to create the ideal personal as a leader in public. Based on the explanation, this study aims to describe the representation of Indonesia's ideal leader on Instagram by using multimodal analysis to understand how Instagram images convey the meanings that support the character of framing created.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1. Framing

Capella dan Jamieson (1997) see the framing as the way a story text is written or produced. Framing is an explicit message, implied and activated in the mind of the audience without the audience realizing that the message has been activated, framing done by the media can be interpreted differently by the audience.

According to Entman (1993), to frame is to selectively emphasize/evaluate certain aspects of a perceived reality and to make them more salient in a communicating text, "in such a way as to promote a particular problem definition, causal interpretation, moral evaluation, and/or treatment recommendation for the item described". In other words, to frame is to actively construct the meaning of the reality in question.

2.2. Framing and Political Actor

According to Grittmann (2012) the production, selection and distribution of visual images in terms of image management by politicians can help to create the image of people or groups of people, their behavior and lifestyle and their character (Liebhart & Bernhardt, 2017). This explanation is reinforced by Druckman (2001) opinion, that in order to win a campaign, political actors frame the issue at stake strategically and "campaign on behalf of competing ways of understanding what is at issue". They try to achieve an emphasis effect, that is, to lead the media or individuals to focus on certain aspects of an issue instead of others when constructing their opinion.

Characters displayed by candidates / political actors through visual framing based on Grabe dan Bucy (2009), consists of three major themes: the ideal candidate, populist campaigner and the sure loser. The Ideal Candidate theme is described in two dimensions: Statesmanship and Compassion. Statesmanship is communicated visually through images related to power, control, and active leadership. The dimension of statesmanship is described through images that contain subdimensions: elected official/influential, patriotic symbols, progress, identifiable entourage, campaign paraphernalia, and formal attire. Compassion is illustrated through pictures that convey warmth and kindness: children, family associations, admiring individual, religious, affinity gestures, interaction with individuals, physical embraces.

The populism theme has two dimensions, mass appeal and ordinariness. The mass appeal is related to images that display celebrities, large audiences, approving audiences, dan interaction with crowds. The image shows various forms of popularity that the candidate has. The second dimension is ordinariness, usually described by candidates who use informal attire, casual dress, and ordinary people.

The third theme is the sure loser, this theme is usually not used in analyzing candidate framing. This is because this theme is constructed by missteps in campaigns that are not intentionally created by candidates. The theme of the sure loser is usually portrayed by a small crowds and loss of supports.

2.3. Instagram

Instagram is seemingly the most well-known application globally. Generally, Instagram is a simple way to capture, customize and share photos and videos with a number of people known as "followers". As a user, you are free to choose whom you allow access to view what you share (Eldin, 2016)

According to Zappavigna (2016) Instagram is an 'application' of social photography designed to run on smartphones that allows social media users to create visual and textual meanings, where other users can interact with that meaning. The application is a collection of meanings and functionalities, each of which is characterized by its own unique name and icon which can be accessed online via a smartphone. Instagram gives a number of semiotic modes to users, such as visual and written modalities, and imposes a number of semiotic constraints on the dimensions of the image and the length of the caption.

Eldin (2016) defines Instagram as a very important medium and is a relatively new form of communication where users can easily share their updates by taking photos and changing them using filters. Since its launch in October 2010, Instagram's growth has seen a rapid growth based on the total number of users and also photo uploads.

2.4 Visual Framing via Instagram

According to O'Connell, (2018), Instagram is the perfect modern tool to advertise yourself in public. By posting images that manage carefully, the leader candidates can produce a brand name for themselves that best suits their political needs. An image is truly worth thousands of words, so we can learn a lot about the political strategies of political members simply by exploring the patterns behind the images they share. Fenno (1978) defines Instagram as one of the social media, used by candidates or political actors as a tool to present themselves in accordance with what they want to create. Images that they have posted on Instagram are a means for voters to identify themselves as candidates (O'Connell, 2018).

2.5 Multimodality

Multimodality is said to be "a technical term that aims to show that the meaning we have done utilizes various semiotic " which can be defined as "the use of several semiotic modes in product design, or semiotic events simultaneously, and in certain ways these modes are combined for— strengthen, complement, or be in a certain arrangement " (Kress & Leeuwen, 2001)

Multimodality focuses on the process of creating meaning by studying various sources forming meaning together and seeing how the combinations and interactions between the various modes emerge to the overall meaning (O'Halloran & Smith, 2011)

3. METHODOLOGY

This study analyzed Instagram posts from selected Indonesian presidents in the 2019 presidential election period. Instagram data was obtained through crawling analysis techniques using python. Python as a program language with certain scripts capable of crawling data on the internet platform in this case the Instagram. Crawling results will be converted into statistical data in the form of excel which makes it easier to read: the url link directly to the posted image, post date, number of likes, number of comments, and

description of the image used.

Instagram data for content analysis was taken and analyzed during the 2019 main presidential period from September 21, 2018, to April 17, 2019. The starting date represented the announcement of the names of the pairs of candidates for president and vice president. The date of the end point was chosen based on the selected election time. From that time period, 4 images were selected based on the most likes and comments representing four dimensions in two major themes, the personal framing framework of Grab and Bucy. Images that represent each dimension were then analyzed using multimodal analysis to see in detail the modes used to compile the framing framework.

The approach used in multimodal analysis methods was linguistics systemic functional because it aims to describe the source of semiotics used by users. In multimodal analysis, three theories metafunctions were used: ideational function, interpersonal function, and textual function. The main object of this research was photos uploaded by President Joko Widodo's account on Instagram social media.

4. RESULT

4.1 Indonesia Election dan Joko Widodo

Indonesia has a population of 236.73 million and is dominated by Javanese, which is as much as 40.22% or around 95.2 million people (BPS, 2018). Indonesia is led by a president who has a tenure of five years. The leaders who had served as Indonesian Presidents were Soekarno, Suharto, Abdurrahman Wahid, Megawati, Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono and Joko Widodo. The six presidents of Indonesia are Javanese. The election of the Indonesian President was held simultaneously and the community had the right to directly elect the President of Indonesia. Presidential elections were first held in 2004.

In the 2019 presidential election, Joko Widodo run as the incumbent candidate with the same opponent in the previous 2014 presidential election, namely Prabowo Subianto (kpu.go.id). Joko Widodo was the elected president of Indonesia in 2014. He was a descendant of a Javanese born in Surakarta, Central Java on June 21, 1961. In his leadership, Joko Widodo has several achievements such as relatively advanced growth in the field of infrastructure development, for example toll roads and airports and can control the inflation rate.

4.2 The Ideal Candidate

4.2.1 Joko Widodo and Statesman Frame

Based on the personal framing framework of Grab and Bucy (2009), in a frame that shows elected officials and other influential people, candidates appear together with people who have power, status and money, both at the national or local level. Jokowi's photo with the theme of statesmanship is represented by photos uploaded on April 14, 2019.

The photo shows Jokowi walking along with the Governor of Riyadh, Prince Faisal and accompanied by his staff behind. Jokowi and Prince Faisal were in focus in the photo because they were both in the front row. In addition, Jokowi also uses a blue suit that more colorful than others. Through this photo, Jokowi wants to show himself as a leader.



Fig 1. Joko Widodo and Influential People

Multimodal analysis consists of three parts : ideational, interpersonal and textual or compositional. Ideational

structure realizes the meaning of experience consisting of three aspects: processes, participants, and circumstances. Process is the core of the events in the picture which consists of physical, behavioral and relational or existential activities. Each type of process determines the type of participation, which includes the actor of the process, or becomes something that is subject to the process. In visual language, transitivity can be seen from a vector. In the photo, the vector of Jokowi's gaze leads to the camera (paralell).

In process analysis, images display a process, characterized by the presence of participants as actors who do things with a specific purpose. The image leads to agentive-projective where the actor is described as occupying a certain position and another actor occupies another position. There is action in the picture, because Jokowi as a participant looks at the goal (audience). The vector is directed forward (audience). Circumstances describe the situations of formal and serious relations.

Interpersonally, images are viewed from contact, social distance and attitude. Based on contact analysis, images are included in the demand category because it leads to participants who look at audiences and seem to communicate with audiences. Social distance: social (medium shoot), because the relations that are displayed socially do not lead to taking pictures that are close up or maximal, taking a medium image shows that he wants to show the interaction that has been done, so that everything can be covered in frames. Images emphasize the position of the actor close to "us" (audience). Attitude analysis: subjectivity-involvement-equality because it displays relationships between participants and audiences - Participant's involvement with the audience (through the future gaze), shows the relationship of equality or similarity with the audience because of the forward direction.

In composition, salience-medium salience because the image does not aim to highlight certain elements, all interaction and participants are covered in one frame. Framing-maximum connection because there is a match between the caption writing describing the activity description from the photo. This photo consists of several subdimensions, such as formal attire, nationalism indicated by the use of Indonesian flag colored badges (red and white), and photographs accompanied by influential people who have status.

4.2.2 Joko Widodo and Compassion

Photo uploaded by Jokowi on April 15, 2019, shows Jokowi accompanied by his family (his wife and two children) out of kakbah. They used white Umrah clothes and were escorted by uniformed guards behind him. The white clothes worn are referents with clean and saintly personality traits. Photos taken from the front below so that jokowi looks taller than audience. Jokowi directs his attention to the crowd below. Circumstances show the situation in the photo, which is crowded and with religious elements because the photo background is kakbah.



Fig 2. Joko Widodo and Compassion

Ideally, this picture is a process that is characterized by the presence of participants as subject actors in this case Jokowi who is performing an Umrah and is seen coming out of the Kaaba. There is an action, because participants see a crowd of people (goal).

Interpersonally, images are viewed from contact, social distance and attitude. Based on contact analysis, images are included in the category of offer because participants' views do not lead to audiences and offer audiences to enjoy objects. Social distance: medium shot because the relationships displayed socially do not lead to taking close-up or maximum images, medium shot shows his family's activities covered in frames, not

just focusing on one actor. Images emphasize the position of actors not part of "us" (the audience) but them.

Attitude analysis: objectivity-action orientation because it does not display the relationship between participants and audiences, Action orientation related to the purpose of the photo is to show the action or activity carried out by the participant. In composition, shooting leads to the medium salience because shooting does not aim to not highlight certain elements, the unity of interaction and participants is covered in one frame. In this photo, the dimensions of compassion are arranged not only by two subdimensions, family and religion.

4.3 Populist Campaigner

4.3.1 Joko Widodo and Mass Appeal



Fig 3. Joko Widodo and Mass Appeal

In the campaign photo (Fig.3) uploaded on April 13, 2019, a crowd of people wearing white clothes gathered at Istora Gelora Bung Karno. This picture is followed by a photo caption of thanks from Jokowi to the masses (Indonesia) who supported him. Jokowi does not appear to be in focus or as a center in the picture, he only shows the large mass who support him. Through this photo, it shows Jokowi's popularity like a celebrity in general with a large number of fans.

Based on interpersonal analysis, it is categorized as an offer because the mass of Jokowi's supporters are offered as objects to be seen by the audience. Social distance: impersonal because the relationship that is displayed is long shot. Attitude analysis: objectivity-knowledge orientation because it does not display the relationship between participants and audiences, the knowledge orientation shows that what Jokowi wants to convey is not the action of the participants but only information about his supporters.

In composition, taking pictures leads to a minimum salience because the aim is not to highlight certain elements, but shows the overall mass (crowd) and and the background half of Istora Gelora Bung Karno.

4.3.2 Joko Widodo and Ordinarity



Fig 4. Joko Widodo and Ordinarity

In this frame, images of political actors are linked to ordinary people or use ordinary or informal clothing. In Fig.4, it seems Joko Widodo is in the center of the crowd of supporters. Jokowi uses a long-sleeved white shirt, black pants and sport shoes. This photo consists of two subdimensions: informal clothing and ordinary people (jokowi supporters). Through this photo, Jokowi shows himself as part of an ordinary person, part of the mass of his supporters who also use white shirt.

Ideally, this image is a process that is characterized by the presence of participants as actors in this case Jokowi who holds his jacket with a smiley expression and is among his supporters. Process-reaction, because participants' gaze do not lead to goals.

Interpersonally, images are viewed from contact, social distance and attitude. Based on contact analysis, images are included in the offer category because the audience is asked to enjoy the actor as his object and there is no communication between the audience and participants because the participant's gaze does not lead to the audience. Social distance: personal because it takes close-up images that show Jokowi in detail as a single actor. Images emphasize the position of actors not part of "us" (the audience) but them. Attitude analysis: objectivity-action orientation because it does not display the relationship between participants and the audience. The orientation of the photo is to show the actions or activities carried out by participants. In composition, shooting leads to maximum salience because it aims to highlight certain elements.

5. DISCUSSION

Based on the personal framework of Grab and Bucy, the candidate figure chosen as the ideal leader figure has photo uploads relating to the themes of ideal candidates (statesmanship and compassion) and populist campaigner (mass appeal and ordinariness). In the study of Goodnow (2013), the United States presidential candidate also presented the four ideal leaders design from Grab and Bucy. This also applies to Indonesia's ideal leader, Joko Widodo. The four ideal sub-dimensions of leaders are applied in each candidate's photo post, but each candidate has the tendency to use one of the subdimensions. In the Instagram post, Joko Widodo, is filled with the ideal dimensions of candidates including compassion and statemanship. The Joko Widodo statemanship is filled with photos that feature formal attire, elected official/influential, patriotic symbol, and progress symbols. He doesn't use a lot of progress symbols. In fact, as an incumbent candidate it was very profitable for Joko Widodo to show progress symbols as a result of the performance and achievements achieved during his leadership period. On the contrary, in this study, Joko Widodo tend to show his self-image that was filled with the theme of compassion which showed his position as part of the family, "kebakakan", simplicity, and children.

There are several reasons why Joko Widodo shows himself as a compassionate leader. It is based on the values of the Indonesian people, especially Java, about a leader who is always simple, family love, fatherly figure, and not showing off, all of these aspects lead to the creation of harmony. According to opinion (Geertz, 1961; Mulder, 1978) that Javanese people believe individuals act as a harmonious part of family groups. In particular, being Javanese means that an individual must know and adapt to manners and its place in a family group or community (Santoso, 2012).

Values in this culture indicate that individuals must maintain the harmony that exists, as Joko Widodo did is by not posting many symbols of progress as achievements (not showing off). Not only that, this is complemented by the background of Joko Widodo, who is a descendant of Java, namely Solo and the condition of the Indonesian people dominated by Javanese people. In addition, according to Santoso (2012), Java is the most populous island in Indonesia and is the center of the Indonesian government. So, when Joko Widodo sold his image on Instagram, he used the values and ethics in Javanese culture to take the sympathy of the Indonesian people, the majority of whom were Javanese. It is undeniable that the leaders who have become Indonesian presidents are Javanese people, which means that winning the hearts of the dominant Javanese people of Indonesia is important and this is done by using an approach to values that they like and in accordance with their culture.

Evidence that the values of simplicity and kinship to maintain harmony is still a powerful weapon for candidates to display their image seen from the number of likes in these posts. In Joko Widodo's Instagram, followers prefer photos with the theme of compassion. This can be seen from the many photos posted by Joko Widodo, the theme of compassion being the photo most liked by followers (have the highest number of

likes). Through these facts, it can be seen that Indonesian cultural values greatly influence how candidates represent themselves. Likewise for candidates in other countries, it also has the value it shows according to the culture of each country.

In the study of Muñoz & Towner (2017), US presidential candidates tended to show the ideal dimensions of candidates especially statemanship compared to compassion. This is due to the individualistic culture of American society that sees someone as a leader because of his abilities and achievements not because of who he is. This is shown in (www.changeconomy.com.au) that the United States ranks highest on the level of individualism and is reinforced by Hofstede's research, that American society tends to have an individualist culture. The culture of individualism does not see who we are and family status but rather looks at individual abilities.

6. CONCLUSION

The posted image has a deeper meaning than what the candidate actually wants to convey. The four subdimensions are indeed owned by each presidential candidate, but each country has a tendency to one dimension based on cultural values in that society. In the case of Joko Widodo, cultural values play an important role in influencing candidates to create their self-image in public.

7. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The author would like to thank the Indonesia Endowment Fund for Education (LPDP) for funding this research.

REFERENCE LIST

- Center, P. R. (2016, July 18). Campaigns as a Direct Source of News. Diambil kembali dari Pew Research Center: http://assets.pewresearch.org/wp-content/uploads/sites/13/2016/07/PJ_2016.07.18_election-2016_FINAL.pdf
- Druckman, J. N. (2001). The implications of framing effects for citizen competence. *Political Behaviour*, 225-256. doi:10.1023/A:1015006907312
- Dutta, S., & Fraser, M. (2008, November 19). Barack Obama and the Facebook Election. Diambil kembali dari US News: <https://www.usnews.com/opinion/articles/2008/11/19/barack-obama-and-the-facebook-election>
- Eldin, D. A. (2016). Instagram Role In Influencing Youth Opinion In 2015 Election Campaign In Bahrain. *European Scientific Journal*, 245-257. doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.19044/esj.2016.v12n2p245>
- Entman, R. M. (1993). Framing: Toward clarification of a fractured paradigm. *Journal of Communication*, 51-58. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1460-2466.1993.tb01304.x>
- Filimonov, K., Russmann, U., & Svensson, J. (2016). Picturing the Party: Instagram and Party Campaigning in the 2014 Swedish Elections. *Social Media + Society*, 1-11. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1177%2F2056305116662179>
- Goodnow, T. (2013). Facing Off: A Comparative Analysis of Obama and Romney Facebook Timeline Photographs. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 1584-1595. doi:10.1177/0002764213489013
- Iedema, R. (2003). Multimodality, Resemiotization: Extending the Analysis of Discourse as Multi-semiotic Practice. *Visual Communication*, 1-30. doi:10.1177/1470357203002001751
- Kress, G., & Leeuwen, T. v. (2001). *Multimodal Discourse the Modes and Media of Contemporary Communication*. Great Britain: Arnold.
- Liebhart, K., & Bernhardt, P. (2017). Political Storytelling on Instagram: Key Aspects of Alexander Vander Bellen's Successful 2016 Presidential Election Campaign. *Media and Communication*, 15-25. doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.17645/mac.v5i4.1062>
- MILLER, C. C. (2008, November 7). How Obama's Internet Campaign Changed Politics. Diambil kembali

dari New York Times: <https://bits.blogs.nytimes.com/2008/11/07/how-obamas-internet-campaign-changed-politics/>

- Muñoz, C. L., & Towner, T. L. (2017). The Image is the Message: Instagram Marketing and the 2016 Presidential Primary Season. *Journal of Political Marketing*, 1-46. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1080/15377857.2017.1334254>
- O'Connell, D. (2018). #Selfie: Instagram and the United States Congress. *Social Media + Society*, 1-17. doi:[10.1177/2056305118813373](https://doi.org/10.1177/2056305118813373)
- O'Halloran, K. L., & Smith, B. A. (2011). *Multimodal Studies Exploring Issues and Domains*. New York: Routledge.
- Santoso, B. (2012). The Influence of javanese Culture in Power of Making Decisions in Indonesian Universities : Case Studies in MM Programmes. *Journal of Indonesian Economy and Business*, 224-241.
- STAFF, P. R. (2012, August 15). How the Presidential Candidates Use the Web and Social Media. Diambil kembali dari Pew Research Center: <https://www.journalism.org/2012/08/15/how-presidential-candidates-use-web-and-social-media/>
- Towner, T. L., & Munoz, C. L. (2017). Picture Perfect? The Role of Instagram in Issue Agenda Setting During the 2016 Presidential Primary Campaign. *Social Science Computer Review*, 1-16. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1177%2F0894439317728222>
- Twiplomacy. (2018, December 4). World Leaders on Instagram 2018. Diambil kembali dari Twiplomacy: <https://twiplomacy.com/blog/world-leaders-instagram-2018/>
- Williams, C. B. (2017). Introduction: Social Media, Political Marketing and the 2016 U.S. Election. *Journal of Political Marketing*, 1-7. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1080/15377857.2017.1345828>
- Zappavigna, M. (2016). Social media photography: construing subjectivity in Instagram images. *visual communication*, 271–292. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1177%2F1470357216643220>