THE STRUGGLE OF WOMEN'S TRADERS IN FLOATING MARKET FROM THE PERSPECTIVES OF CITIZENSHIP: IMPLICATIONS FOR CITIZENSHIP STUDIES

Sarbaini Sarbaini1*, Fatimah Fatimah2, and Ismi Rajiani3

1Dr. Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, INDONESIA, sarbaini@ulm.ac.id
2Dr. Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, INDONESIA, fatimah@ulm.ac.id
3Dr. Universitas Muhammadiyah Gresik, INDONESIA
*Corresponding Author

Abstract

Indonesia is a vast country with various culture, including rivers and people. One of the cultures is a floating market with its life aspects. This study aims to explore the values of citizenship that underlie the struggle of women to become traders in the floating market to survive until now. The data of the citizenship perspective were collected through in-depth interviews. The results show that the struggle of women to become traders in floating markets to survive until now in order to maintain their lives and to be able to improve the welfare of family life lasts until now by securing and practicing the values citizenship based of rights and obligations. The implication for citizenship education is to make the citizenship values of floating market traders women as models and sources of development of values and character of citizenship based on the local wisdom in schools and class.

Keywords: Women traders, Floating markets, Citizenship values

1 INTRODUCTION

Indonesia is a large country with a variety of cultures, including rivers and people. One of them is floating market women traders with various aspects of their life. The existence of the floating market in this city has been very long, and this market was created due to the natural conditions of the city which has many rivers. This city is called a city of thousand rivers. The rivers themselves function as trade routes and economic veins rooted in rivers. Their existence is also inseparable from the history of Banjar culture, namely the founding of the Banjar Bandarmasih royal center and the trade center. Therefore, historically, most Banjar people work as traders along the river which is the trade route, including women traders in the floating market. Most of the traders who are active in the floating market are women (Fatimah, 2001; Fatimah et al, 2015). It means they work outside the home.

Women, in Banjar culture, according to the norms applied in Banjar family life, are influenced by a kinship system based on the bilineal system. The position of husband and wife in a family is together, with their respective duties and obligations in certain matters. The kinship system of the Banjar community is also based on Islamic norms. Therefore, the manners that regulate the relationship between men and women tends to be patriarchal. Likewise, the division of domestic work is still based on traditional gender differences, men work outside the home, whereas women inside the home (Nawawi et al, 1984: 15-16, 31-45). However, women can also enter the public sphere, depending on their abilities, opportunities, and conditions where they are (Saleh, et al, 1978/1979).

The position of women floating market traders in Banjar culture is interesting to be investigated in the perspective of citizenship. The reason is because in a society, a number of people’s habits are related to the concepts of "citizenship", and citizenship returns to the concepts of socialization of social/cultural values.
Like other values, social/cultural values are mainly internalized through family and educational institutions (Chanzanagh, Mansoori, Zarsazkar, 2011). In addition, the concept of citizenship is no longer merely referring to the classic concept of citizenship from T.H. Marshall which has civil, political and social dimensions (Abowitz & Harnish, 2006), or legal, political and social (Iija, 2011). However, it is related to all aspects of people's lives (Iija, 2011), carries cross-understanding that includes political, judicial, ethical, social and cultural dimensions (Lefrancois & Ethier, 2007) and across other dimensions, such as social, economic and political (MaCregor, et al., 2005), gender (Voet, 1998; Pateman, 1998; Yuval-Davis, 1999; Lister, 2003; Siim, 2000; Abowitz and Harnish, 2006), cultural (Rosaldo, 1994; Ong, 1996), and the environment (Carme Melo-Escrihuela, 2008; Meer & Martlsson, 2010; Dobson, 2010).

In other words, definitions of citizenship include many things and include a collection of social, political, psychological attitudes, values and behaviors (Perry & Katula, 2001; Sherrod et al. 2002). There are three parts to the definition of citizenship which cover various dimensions of what constitutes citizenship in today's society (Perry & Katula, 2001). First, individual motivations and skills are determined by the authors as personal attitudes that can be expressed through interests and relationships with the community. Explaining citizenship with this dimension also involves cognitive skills such as problem solving and awareness and deeper understanding of social issues. Second, it includes generous and citizenship behaviors. The authors explain this aspect of citizenship in terms of nonpolitical behaviors, such as charitable donations and volunteering. Third, political behavior describes the behavior of a person which is specifically related to citizenship (such as voting, campaigning and carrying out a chosen position).

The shifts in the conception and definition of citizenship bring changes to forms of citizenship in accordance with the historical and cultural context and its relation to local, national or global communities (Meer & Sever, 2004; Abowitz and Harnish, 2006). Citizenship is membership of a group; a community that confer rights, responsibilities, status, identity, practices, processes and participation related to the social world through the use of rights/protections and fulfillment of obligations, both at home (domestic-private) and outside the home (public) (Abowitz and Harnish, 2006; Meer and Sever, 2004; Iija, 2011). Membership is related to ethnic minority, religious, or gender minority groups (Skeie, 2003).

To this far, the conception of citizenship is dominated by the conceptions of liberals and republicans. The conception of the liberals that emphasizes individual rights and equality to fully use freedom in the social world, has a legal dimension, is centered on the private sphere, to protect against the autonomy of the private sphere (Weinstock, 2000; Abowitz and Harnish, 2006). Meanwhile, the conception of the republicans on citizenship is oriented towards the public sphere, emphasizing participation in the common good "and strong respect, love and service to political society (local, state, nation, (Weinstock, 2000; Abowitz and Harnish, 2006). These two concepts separate private sphere and emphasize legal rights (the liberal model) on one hand with the public sphere on the other as well as emphasize the loyalty of political society (Thomson, 1970; Weinstock, 2000; Abowitz and Harnish, 2006).

The conception of citizenship among republicans and liberals has been criticized by feminists because it is detrimental to women who tend to be placed only in the private/domestic sphere. Therefore, feminists reframe the conception of citizenship, especially regarding membership, status, identity, rights, needs, dependencies, forms of practices and processes of participation, as well as relations with the power of women as citizens in a gender perspective (Kenway & Langmead, 2000; Meer and Sever, 2004; Abowitz and Harnish, 2006).

In relation to the concepts of gender and citizenship, there are three models of citizenship. These models have grown out of feminist efforts to rearrange the concepts of gender and citizenship which lead to the deconstruction of power relations and attack the concept of citizenship as a state that is essentially male (Çela, 2015). The first is gender-neutral citizenship which focuses on the allocation and use of rights and obligations and allows women to compete with men in the public sphere and the labor market ((Voet, 1998; Hobson & Lister, 2002). The second is citizenship that distinguishes gender or maternal citizenship, which emphasizes 'differences' rather than 'similarities' based on women's experiences because maternal politics is used as a basis for promoting the demands of women as social and political citizens (Pateman 1992; Elshtein 1981). The third is pluralist-gender citizenship that allows accommodation of social divisions such as gender, class, race, religion, and age, which all cross with gender to shape the citizenship of men and women (Mouffe, 1992; Young, 1990; Hobson & Lister 2002). Citizenship values are divided into two categories: values based on rights and shared values based on obligations. Each of them involves a combination of citizenship values. The citizenship values are based on rights, namely security, freedom, welfare, equality, participation; and the values which are based on obligation are namely legal compliance, respect and responsibility to the community (Chanzanagh, Mansoori, Zarsazkar, 2011).
2 METHOD

The research method used in this study is women's perspective research. This research explores the values of citizenship that underlies the struggle of women to become traders in the floating market to survive until now. The concern is especially about the meaning of work, the role in reproduction, production, and community, and the implications of position with the husband. This study aims to explore the perspective of citizenship values through in-depth interviews with six floating market women trader informants. The respondents were determined by using a purposive sampling technique. The data were analyzed by using the model from Miles and Huberman (2014) namely data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing/verification. Data trustworthiness determining (Brod et al., 2009) is conducted by using the test of the levels of credibility, transferability, dependability, and conformability.

3 FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 Meaning of Work

According to the respondents, "Working is more comfortable than not working". Working means having your own money. Working gives pleasure and satisfaction, and working means getting financial autonomy. The reason for the respondents working is that there is an impulse that it is not possible to only expect the income of a husband, then opportunities in the form of "no levies, and many buyers" and "the cultural value of trading is more proud than being a laborer", have special abilities in the form of "rowing and trading experience" and family support as well as the surrounding environment".

3.2 Role in Reproduction, Production, and Community

The role of work reproduction manifested by women traders consists of the division of household tasks, and household decision making for capital and the use of proceeds. The implementation of chores is based on the division of labor between husband, wife, and children, sometimes involving mothers, in-laws, and even neighbors. However, it is more often done by the wife or handed over to the daughter, mother, mother-in-law, sister, even the husband. Although men help, this result is with different levels of work quantity for each respondent. The decision on the use of money in the household, both in determining capital and using the results, there is a pattern based on togetherness and agreement, it can be the wife who decides or the husband determines. Sometimes, it can be negotiated with the wife or only the husband determines. The position of women in decision making for capital determination and use of income can be stronger, equal and less powerful. This is determined by the amount of income and use of income in households owned by women.

The role of work production is realized by women traders including activities to find sources of initial capital and continued capital, looking for the supply of goods, and the use of transportation, and trading social networks/links. The initial capital obtained by the respondents varied, starting from the capital with the husband and wife, the wife, as well as the husband, and from the child. The initial capital development can be determined by the informant himself, first negotiated with the husband, or together with the husband. Meanwhile, the way to develop advanced capital also varies, in the form of accumulated profits which are reinvested in the form of purchasing trade supplies, following the social gathering (henceforth called arisan) in the form of gathering goods, savings in the form of storing gold, and capital loans to private creditors that are paid daily and market cooperatives. The initial capital acquisition and capital development have strengthened the respondents' financial position to become independent in the development of continued capital. In searching for supply of goods, there are informants respondents do it themselves, with their husbands, and initially with their husbands, eventually it becomes the husband's duty only. The means of transportation used are jukung (alone) and kelotok (together).

The social relations/trading networks of the respondents consist of groups of fellow traders (including women traders), traders, suppliers, and customers. Social networks of the respondents specifically groups of fellow traders that are organized does not seem exist. However, as they often meet, the sense of togetherness, kinship, and mutual help grows among them. This happened because they departed and returned together to and from the floating market were pulled together, and the existence of a group of traders arisan. From the kelotok trailer and arisan area, there was an exchange of information about capital and prices of goods. The relationship of the respondents with the supplier traders is marked by the term "as long as the price is accepted for both", an agreement is made to purchase the supply of goods, and then the respondents have a permanent subscription to the supplier of goods, always provide a good quality supply of goods, have the opportunity to owe and be delivered to the house. A network of respondents with customers, whoever, "just trade freely, harmoniously, and together to find food" both in the form of wholesale and retail.
The role of the community from the respondents is more manifested as “unpaid voluntary work” in order to meet social needs in the community environment, both in religious, social and formal activities. In socio-religious activities, such as mutual assistance during marriages, and deaths, all respondents attend, except to celebrate religious days, such as the celebration of Maulid and Isra Mi’raj, as well as Yasinan activities, which are specifically carried out by women. The role of the respondents in socio-economic activities is to participate in women's arisan activities and sugar arisan. The results are distributed before the Idul Fitri holiday. While social-formal activities held by informants are family welfare empowerment or Pemberdayaan Kesejahteraan Keluarga (PKK) activities. The role of the community in which the respondents acted was essentially closely related to the role of reproduction and production they faced, specifically determining the priority scale of participation in community activities. The role of respondents in the community which is more and seems to be followed is mutual cooperation in celebrating marriage and preparing matters relating to the event of death, especially mourn, while the role of informants in the activities of yasinan, arisan, commemoration of religious holidays and PPK only at any time, according to priority scale.

3.3 Position of Women Traders Citizenship

The respondents, who were initially in a position to help meet economic needs, later developed their position to become a major source of family economics. The respondents' job as it turned out to bring "a new world", because working as a trader in a floating market gives "financial autonomy" with a set of positive psychological aspects that were obtained such as; pleasant feelings, comfort, convenience, satisfaction, certainty, freedom, pride, recreation, social networking and increasing insight. The work activities carried out by the respondents, in fact, bring a new role in their lives, namely the role of reproduction, production, and community, as interlocking multiple roles.

In carrying out reproductive activities seen in the completion of chores, the domestic workload is more borne by women than men, although there are also husbands who help wives. Likewise, in decision making, the decision of initial capital and further capital development is more determined by the wife. While the use of income, both planning, implementation, and responsible for the use of more determined and carried out by the wife, can even be said to be "the main actor". Even so, women cannot fully escape from their domestic roles (division of household tasks and use of income related to household needs), and even still do the most domestic work. Even if the wife is not many, or does not do domestic work, but still women (girls, parents, sisters, nieces and nephews, even neighbors).

The inability of the respondents to break away from domestic work, even though they have worked as a trader in a public area (floating market) is caused by feeling "uncomfortable", "afraid of the norms instilled by the community, that the wife's duty is to do domestic work, including serving husband". This view reflects in the respondents that there is still a dichotomy of domestic work and public work. Within the respondents and family on the part of women, the norm is still embedded that domestic work is women's work. Although they have not been able to completely change the view that domestic work as compulsory land is done by women, in certain matters relating to domestic work, there are men who help do it.

Positive things received by respondents as traders are in decision making. Decision making in the household is determined based on the principle of togetherness and agreement. In practice the wife can determine more. The position of the wife and husband are equal, or sometimes the husband and wife negotiate, but the husband determines. The role of production in a variety of work activities shows the position of the wife tends to be more prominent than the husband, especially in finding initial capital and continued capital. There is an independent, parallel and strengthened position. In looking for goods, the wife's position is more prominent than the husband's position. Meanwhile, the use of transportation means more women use their own boat. The role of women traders in the floating market in their position with their husbands, on the one hand there is a strengthening of "autonomy" for the wife. However, it still adds to the domestic workload, due to the burden of cultural norms. The role of reproduction and production has been fulfilled, the role of the community depends on the priority scale, except for marriages and deaths are the role of volunteers who are obliged to participate in mutual cooperation carried out by both women and men.

3.4 Women Floating Market Traders from Citizenship Perspective

The struggle of women as the floating market traders to raise their existence as citizens has several citizenship values which form the basis of their behavior. The values of citizenship in view of the meaning of work such as "working more comfortably", "no levies" (security), "owning money" (freedom), "giving pleasure and satisfaction", "many customers" (welfare), "get financial autonomy", "It is not possible to only expect the income of a husband", "rowing and trading experience" (independence), "and trading culture values are more proud"(pride). Meanwhile, the role of reproduction is based on the values of togetherness, agreement, and
alignment proportionally, and the role of production is related to the values of togetherness, agreement, independence, kinship, help, help, agreement, freedom and harmony, and the role of the community based on the values of volunteerism and mutual cooperation.

The values of citizenship embodied in the role of women traders prove that the concepts of citizenship return to the concepts of socialization of social/cultural values. Like other values, social/cultural values are mainly internalized through family and educational institutions (Chanzanagh, Mansoori, Zarsazkar, 2011), which relate to all aspects of people's lives (Iija, 2011), social and cultural (David Lefrancois and Marc Andre Ethier, 2007), social, economic (MacGregor et al., 2005), and gender (Voet, 1998; Pateman, 1998; Yuval-Davis, N, 1999; Lister, 2003; Sim, 2000; Abowitz, 2006). Citizenship values which are the foundation of women floating market traders in carrying out the role of reproduction, production and community are manifestations of the implementation of values based on rights and values based on obligations, each involving a combination of citizenship values. Citizenship values are based on rights, namely security, freedom, welfare, equality, participation; and the values of obligation-based citizenship, namely compliance with rules, respect and responsibility to the community (Chanzanagh, et al, 2011).

The behavior of floating market women traders gaining autonomy in their status and identity as citizens with all the rights and obligations they have, including the position of "autonomous" and "independence" they have in their reproductive, production and community roles, shows that there are conceptions, definitions and forms of citizenship related to local communities (Meer & Sever, 2004; Abowitz, 2006). A member of a group or community, whether ethnic minority, religious, or gender minority (Skeie, 2003), is given rights, responsibilities, status, identity, practice, process, and participation related to social world through the use of rights/ protections and fulfillment of obligations, both at home (domestic-private) and outside the home (public) (Abowitz, 2006; Meer & Sever, 2004; Iija, 2011).

Women, in Banjar culture according to the norms applied in Banjar family life, are influenced by a kinship system based on the bilineal system. The position of husband and wife in a family is together, with their respective duties and obligations in certain matters. The kinship system of the Banjar community is also based on Islamic norms. Therefore, the manners that regulate the relationship between men and women tend to be patriarchal. Likewise, the division of domestic work is still based on traditional gender differences, men work outside the home, whereas women inside the home (Nawawi et al, 1984: 15-16, 31-45). However, women can also enter the public sphere, depending on their abilities, opportunities, and conditions where they are (Saleh, et al, 1978/1979).

To this far, the conception of citizenship is dominated by the conceptions of liberals and republicans. The conception of the liberals that emphasizes individual rights and equality to fully use freedom in the social world, has a legal-legal dimension, is centered on the private sphere, to protect against the autonomy of the private sphere (Weinstock, 2000; Abowitz, 2006). Meanwhile, the conception of the republicans on citizenship is oriented towards the public sphere, emphasizing participation in the common good "and strong respect, love and service to political society (local, state, nation, (Weinstock, 2000; Abowitz, 2006). These two concepts separate private sphere and emphasize legal rights (the liberal model) on one hand with the public sphere on the other as well as emphasize the loyalty of political society (Thomson, 1970; Weinstock, 2000: Abowitz, 2006). Both of these views are detrimental to women who tend to be placed only in the private/domestic sphere. Therefore, feminists reframe the conception of citizenship, especially regarding membership, status, identity, rights, needs, dependencies, forms of practices and processes of participation, as well as relations with the power of women as citizens in a gender perspective (Kenway & Langmead, 2000; Meer and Sever, 2004; Abowitz, 2006).

Seen from the three models of citizenship that grew out of feminist efforts (Çela, 2015), the position of citizenship of floating market traders in Banjar society is included in the first category, namely gender-neutral citizenship, which is centered on the allocation and use of rights and obligations, and allow women to compete with men in the public sphere and the labor market (Voet, 1998; Hobson & Lister, 2002, 37), even
the floating market is dominated by women. This is because in the floating market not only women who trade but also provide opportunities for men. Therefore, it can also be categorized as pluralist-gender citizenship, allowing accommodation of social divisions such as gender, class, race, religion, and age, which all cross with gender to shape male and female citizenship (Mouffe, 1992; Young, 1990; Hobson & Lister 2002).

The citizenship model of floating market women traders with a set of citizenship values based on rights and obligations bestowed by the community and community of the Banjar tribe is a manifestation of the position of women in the Banjar culture. The position illustrates the conception, definition, and form of citizenship of floating market traders who originate from an Islamic norm-based culture that governs the behavior of the Banjar family and family system based on the bilineal system, namely the position of husband and wife in a family together, with duties and obligations each. But in certain cases are patriarchal, including the division of domestic work is still based on traditional gender differences, men work outside the home, while women inside the home (Nawawi et al, 1984: 15-16,31-45). However, women can also enter the public sphere, depending on their abilities, opportunities, and conditions where they are (Saleh, et al, 1978/1979).

4 CONCLUSION

The citizenship model and set of citizenship values that are bestowed by the community to women floating market traders are different from the large stream of citizenship models such as republican, liberal and gender, because they originate in local communities, based on culture and religion. The implication for citizenship education is to make the citizenship values of floating market women traders as models and sources of development of values and character of citizenship based on local wisdom in schools and in class.

REFERENCE LIST


Dobson, A. (2010). Environment citizenship and pro-environmental behavior, rapid research and evidence review.


ISBN: 978-605-82433-7-8


